



This is ATLANTIS, a journal of postal Diplomacy*, edited and published by Christopher and Deborah Schleicher, 314 East Old Willow Road, Apt. 214, Wheeling, Illinois 60090. Subscriptions to ATLANTIS are 10 issues for 20 10¢ stamps. The game fee for the one remaining game opening is \$7.00.

*Diplomacy is a registered trademark of the game of international politics and diplomatic negotiations manufactured by Games Research, Inc., 500 Harrison Ave., Boston, Mass. 02118. Diplomacy is available for \$10.95, postpaid, direct from GRI. The 1971 Rulebook is also available for \$1 from GRI.

ATLANTIS circulation: 104

CONTENTS

Features:

The Diplomacy Association presents "Convoy's Aren't A Puzzlement"	Page 3
Commentary	Page 5
Etc.	Page 6

Games:

R-5, 1971CQ, "Spring 1910"	Page 2
R-6, 1971DF, "Winter 1909"	Page 2
R-7, 1972BO, "Spring 1908"	Page 7
R-8, 1972BY, "Spring 1908"	Page 7
R-9, TDA #1, "Winter 1907"	Page 7
R-10, TDA #2, "Spring 1907"	Page 8
R-12, TDA #4, "Spring 1907"	Page 8
R-13, TDA #5, "Fall 1907"	Page 9
R-14, TDA #6, "Winter 1906"	Page 9
R-15, TDA #7, "Spring 1901"	Page 9
R-16, TDA #8, "Spring 1901"	Page 10

ATLANTIS © Copyright 1975, Christopher Schleicher, Wheeling, Illinois 60090. All rights reserved. No part may be reproduced in any manner without the written permission of the publisher.

"Spring 1910"

TURKEY (McGee):

F Ion-Tyr
F Tun (S) F Ion-Tyr
F Alb-Adr
F Aeg-Ion
F Smy-Aeg
A Mun-Ruh
A Sil-Mun
A Ber (S) A Sil-Mun
A Vie-Tyr
A Ser-Bud
A Bul-Ser
A Con-Bul
A Ank-Con
A Swe-Den
A Fin holds
A Gre holds
A Tri holds

1971 CQ

FRANCE (Ripperda):
A Lon holds
A Por-Spa
F NAT-Mid
F Bre (S) F NAT-Mid
F Iri (S) F NAT-Mid

R-5

GERMANY (Ayres):

A Den-Kie
A Kie-Hol
F Hol-Nth

ITALY (McLenoan):

F Mar-Spa (sc)
F Mid (S) F Mar-Spa (sc)
F Wes (S) F Mar-Spa (sc)
F NAT (S) F Mid
A Par-Bre
A Bur-Pic
A Ven-Pie

Underlined moves do not succeed.

"Fall 1910" moves are due 13 May 1975.

Rome:

These are the last days of Christian Western Civilization. We can't stop the great tragedy but we can attack those who are at fault! Paris will burn! We will KILL THE FRENCH!.

All is finished (sob) (sob).

=====

"Winter 1909"

1971DF

R-6

AUSTRIA (Thorgaard): Vie, Bud, Tri, Ser, Gre, Rum, Bul, War, Con, Mos, Sev, Mun, Ank, Tun, Smy, Ven, Kie. (17)* Builds A Vie, A Bud.

ENGLAND (CD): Lon, StP. (2) [GM removes F Nrg.]

GERMANY (Anderson): Hol, Bel, Den, Swe, Nwy, Bre, Par, Edi, Liv, Ber. (10)** No change.

ITALY (Rice): Nap, Rom, Spa, Mar, Pör. (5) [GM removes F Wee.]

The following proposals have been put up for a vote by the players:

- 1) That a three-way draw be declared;
- 2) that Austria be declared a winner, and Germany and Italy tied for second;
- 3) that Austria be declared a winner, Germany second and Italy third.

Votes are requested from all players on each proposal separately --- one "no" vote for any proposal will defeat it. If all proposals are defeated, the "Spring 1910" moves will be published.

All votes are due 13 May 1975.

=====

Telephoned orders will be accepted for all games, however, I will not accept responsibility for failure to reach me by phone. The number is [312] 541-8783. Callers are requested to call no later than 10:30PM local time.

THE DIPLOMACY ASSOCIATION presents

CONVOY'S AREN'T A PUZZLEMENT

by ERIC VERHEIDEN

Part 1

To resolve Pandin's Paradox and eliminate ambiguities in the convoy order, it is necessary to expand Section XII, Paragraph 5 of the 1971 Diplomacy Rulebook. Essentially, that paragraph states: "A convoysd army's attack may not protect any of its convoying fleets."

1. ENGLAND: A Lon-Bel, F Eng C A Lon-Bel, F Nth S A Lon-Bel

FRANCE: F Bsl-Eng, F Brs S F Bel-Eng

Since France's is attacking the English Channel with support and the English Channel is not supported, F Eng is dislodged and A Lon is not allowed to move.

2. ENGLAND: A Lon-Bel, F Eng C A Lon-Bel, F Nth S A Lon-Bsl

FRANCE: F Brs-Eng, F Bel S F Bre-Eng

For the same reason, the adjudication is identical. Without the rule of Section XII, Paragraph 5, it is not sufficiently clear that A Lon failed to reach Belgium, thus cutting the support of F Bel and preventing F Brs-Eng from succeeding.

To understand the adjudication of convoy orders, it is sssential to grasp the significance of whether or not a convoyed army is allowed to move; and when the army is allowed to move, whether or not it is permitted to cut support.

3. ENGLAND: A Lon-Bsl, F Eng C A Lon-Bel, F Nth S F Eng

FRANCE: F Bre-Eng, F Bel S F Bre-Eng

England's convoying fleet is validly supported, protecting it from France's supported attack with or without the convoy. What is relevant in this example is that A Lon does move, but since it is made explicit by Section XII, Paragraph 5, that F Bsl is "supporting a fleet which is attacking...the convoying fleet" of the attacking convoyed army, "that support is not cut."

4. ENGLAND: A Lon-Bel, F Eng C A Lon-Bel, F Nth S A Lon-Bsl, F Wal S F Eng

FRANCE: F Bel-Eng, F Brs S F Bel-Eng

This example is adjudicated in the same manner as if F Eng were attacking F Bel with support. It is a standoff because the two countries are equally supported. In Example 1 F Eng is dislodged, so this example cannot be adjudicated in any other manner. The convoying army is not ordained by the Rulebook with Extraordinary prerogatives.

5. ENGLAND: A Lon-Bel, F Eng C A Lon-Bel, F Nth S A Lon-Bel, F Wal S F Eng

FRANCE: F Bre-Eng, F Bel S F Bre-Eng

Here the convoy succeeds and F Bel is dislodged. Nevertheless, the support of F Bel is valid according to Section XII, Paragraph 5, even though Section X states that a dislodged unit cannot give support. Mr. Calhamer affirms that he did intend Paragraph 5 of section XII to be an exception to Section X.

6. ENGLAND: A Lon-Bel, F Nth C A Lon-Bel, F Eng S A Lon-Bel, F Wal S F Eng

FRANCE: F Bel-Eng, F Bre S F Bel-Eng

Again the convoy succeeds and F Bel is dislodged, but note that the support of F Eng is not cut by the attack of F Bel.

7. ENGLAND: A Lon-Bel, F Nth C A Lon-Bel, F Eng S A Lon-Bel, F Wal S F Eng

FRANCE: F Bre-Eng, F Bel S F Bre-Eng

All moving units fail and the support of F Eng and F Bel is cut. The last four examples involve a unique situation between the combatants. If England convoys via F Eng, France must attack with F Bel; if England convoys via F Nth, France must attack with F Bre.

Part 2

The adjudication problem of the paradox discovered by Anthony Pandin is attributed to a flaw or omission in the logic of the rules. Each of the rules changes hitherto proposed to resolve the paradox is unacceptable, either being completely arbitrary, not conforming to the logic and intent of the Rulebook, or severely limiting the tactical flexibility of Diplomacy. My proposal for solving any paradox withstands each of the preceding objections; most importantly, it does not affect the adjudications of any other convoy orders:

If a convoyed army's attack would affect the position of any of its convoying fleets, the army may not move.

In particular, this rule extends and clarifies the basic concept of Section XII, Paragraph 5, in that it not only prevents a convoyed attack from protecting the convoying fleets but also prevents it from harming them as well, because a convoyed army's attack may not cause the dislodgement of any of its convoying fleets. Whenever the convoying fleets cannot be dislodged, my rule does not apply.

Under this proposed rule, the adjudication of Pandin's Paradox is:

ENGLAND: A Wal-Bel, F Eng C A Wal-Bel, F Lon S F Eng

GERMANY: F Hol-Nth, F Bel S F Hol-Nth

RUSSIA: A Nwy-Lon, F Nth C A Nwy-Lon

FRANCE: F Mid-Eng, F Bre S F Mid-Eng

A Wal-Bel does not move because if the convoyed A Wal is allowed to cut the support of F Bel, F Nth is not dislodged and A Nwy cuts the support of F Lon, which would dislodge England's F Eng. If the convoy of A Nwy is considered first, A Nwy still

does not move because it causes the dislodgment of F Nth and in order to resolve the adjudication, the rule must then be applied to A Wall.

Consider other examples in which the proposed rule applies:

1. ENGLAND: A Lon-Den, F Nth C A Lon-Den, F Ska S A Lon-Den, F Swe S A Lon-Den
GERMANY: F Dsn-Nth, F Hol S F Dsn-Nth
RUSSIA: A Nwy-Lon, F Nth C A Nwy-Lon
FRANCE: F Mid-Eng. F Bre S F Mid-Eng

If the convoyed attack is permitted, it dislodges F Den and breaks the standoff of the German and Ruseian attacks on F Nth. My proposed rule, therefore, does apply, disallowing the convoysd attack. This restores the standoff, preventing F Nth from being dislodged. If F Hol attacks F Nth and F Den supports, the convoy succeeds because support of dislodged F Den is not cut and the German/Russian standoff is not broken.

2. ITALY: A Rom-Tun, F Tyr C A Rom-Tun, F Nap S F Tyr,
F Alb-Ion, F Adr S F Alb-Ion.

TURKEY: A Gre-Nap, F Ion C A Gre-Nap, F Tun S F Ion

FRANCE: F Lyo-Tyr, F Wss S F Lyo-Tyr

This is nothing in the Rulebook covering this problem. If you begin adjudicating with a Rom-Tun, Turkey's F Ion is dislodged by Italy's attack and F Tyr holds. If A Gre-Nap moves first, France dislodges Italy's F Tyr and F Ion is dislodged. It's mundane to reduce Diplomacy to a level where a Gamesmaster is unable to resolve the orders unless he flips a coin to choose which army kicks off. My rule is applicable: The armies may not move since their affect the position of their convoying flotilla.

COMMENTARY

It is with great regret that I am forced to note that Rod Walker is once again attempting to create bad blood in the Diplomacy community.

In EREHWON 83 he bemoaned the fact that THE DIPLOMACY ASSOCIATION had written articles on stalemate positions, and then suggested that although the articles were "unfortunately" copyrighted, publishers could go ahead and reprint the material as long as they "paraphrase" the information! This shows absolutely no concern for the rights of the authors of those articles who compiled the original information and then took the time and effort to present their findings to the Diplomacy community, asking for nothing for their labors! I could see the point of his argument if the articles were published in only one 'zine with a limited circulation. But they are disseminated throughout the entire community by THE DIPLOMACY ASSOCIATION! The articles originally began in Wazir, the publication of TDA. Then the decision was made by TDA to discontinue publishing the articles in Wazir and instead offer that material formerly reserved for Wazir to the entire Diplomacy community by circulating the articles to a number of publishers. In that manner, not only would members of TDA benefit, but also non-members. At no time did or does TDA

charge publishers for the right to reprint or publish TDA-sponsored articles. As far as I know, even Mr. Walker could have published the articles merely by asking for them!

Unfortunately, advising publishers to bypass copyright laws was not enough. In EREHWON 85 he published a TDA copyrighted article "The Boardman Number," without asking or receiving permission to do so. Why? To correct errors in the article, according to his statement! So why didn't he merely write a rebuttal to the article? He did, on 4 February 1975, and sent it to me for publication. It would have appeared in #78, except that EREHWON 85 came out (20 February 1975) before the March issue of ATLANTIS, making his rebuttal redundant.

For any publisher who might seriously consider following Mr. Walker's example and reprinting copyrighted material without waiting for permission, I have heard that legal proceedings will be started by the author of "The Boardman Number" against Mr. Walker.

I don't know of any publisher that can be so hard up for material to print that he will take the work of another without permission....

[Of course, opinions contrary to mine are welcome and will be reproduced if at all possible.]

ETC.

TRADE POLICY: ATLANTIS will trade with any Diplomacy 'zine on an all-for-all basis. A sample copy is being sent to many publishers which do not now trade for ATLANTIS. This is an invitation....

GAME OPENINGS: In ATLANTIS (see page 1); SPECULUM, Dave Kadlecok, 1447 Sierra Creek Way, San Jose, Calif. 95132; Len Lakofka's LIAISONS DANGEREUSES has a game open for novice players, write to him at 644 West Briar Pl., Chicago, Ill. 60657.

Other game openings will be published if the Gamesmasters would only tell me about them....

PRESS RELEASES for all games are encouraged, and will be printed wherever possible, but if you can, please send them in on a separate sheet of paper when you send in moves.

Some players have noticed delays in their 'zines. Would all players please let me know if they are receiving ATLANTIS with enough time for negotiations?

When you send in your orders please also note somewhere if you think more time should be allowed, or if you want a different type of delivery (i.e., air mail instead of first class).

"Spring 1908"

TURKEY (Beshara):

A Mun-Bur
A Sil-Ber
A Boh-Sil
A War-Pru
A Ukr-War
A Mos-Liv
A Sev-Nos
A Rum-Gal
A Con-Bul
A Rom-Tus
A Pie-Mar
F Lyo (S) A Pie-Mar
F Tyr-Wes
F Tun (S) F Tyr-Wes
F Ion-Tyr
F Smy-Aeg
F Bla-Con

1972BO

ENGLAND (McCuistion):

A Liv-StP
F Edi-Nrg [NSU]
A Edi holds
F NAF-Mid
F Mid-Por
A Mar holds [Dislodged]
A Nwy holds
A Hol holds
A Bur holds
A Kie holds
A Ruh holds
F Bal holds
F Nrg holds
F Nth holds
F Ber holds

R-7

FRANCE (CD):

A Gab

Underlined moves do not succeed.

"Fall 1908" moves are due 13 May 1975.

"Spring 1908"

TURKEY (Ayres):

A Bul-Rum
A Sev (S) A Bul-Rum
A Con-Bul
A Ssr-Bud
F Smy-Asg
F Alb-Ion
F Tri holds
F Ion-Nap

1972BY

GERMANY (Eisen):

A Bre-Gas
A Gas-Mar
A Bur (S) A Gas-Mar
A Mun-Tyr
A Boh (S) A Mun-Tyr
A Sil (S) A War
A War (S) ENGLISH A Liv-Mos
A Ber-Mun
F Sws holds
F Bel-Pic

AUSTRIA (Jordan): NMR

A Mos
A Ukr
A Vie
F Tyr

ENGLAND (Horton):

A Liv-StP
F Nwy-Nth
F NAF-Wes
F Wss-Spa (sc)
F Mid (S) F Wes-Spa (sc)
ITALY (Bsnt): NMR
A Spa [Dislodged]
A Tyr
A Ven
A Pie
F Lyo
F Por

R-8

Underslined moves do not succeed. The Italian A Spa is annihilated. "Fall 1908" moves are due 13 May 1975.

XXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXX

"Wintsr 1907"

TDA #1

R-9

AUSTRIA (Roter): Bud, Vie, Gre, Ser, Bul, Rum, Ank, Con, Smy, Ven, Tri. (11)*
Builds A Bud.

ENGLAND (Ripperda): Edi, Liv, Lon, Nwy, Swe, Den, StP, Mos, Sev, War, Hol. (11)
Builds F Liv, F Edi.

FRANCE (Ayres): Bre, Mar, Par, Bsl, Mun, Por, Kie, Spa, Ber. (9) Rsmoves A Par.
ITALY (Huff): Nap, Rom, Tun. (3)* A Ven (R), F Aeg (R).

"Spring 1908" moves are due 13 May 1975.

R-10

"Spring 1907"

ENGLAND (Verheiden):

F NAT-Cly
 A Liv (S) F NAT-Cly
 F Iri-Eng
 F Nth-Nrg
 F Den (S) F Kie
 F Kie holds
 A Yor-Edi

TDA #2

ITALY (Hyatt):
 A Ven (S) A Tri
A Rom-Apu
A Stri (S) A Ser
 A Ser (S) A Bul
A Bul (S) F Aeg-Con
 F Nap-Ion
 F Gra (S) A Bul
F Aeg-Con

FRANCE (Holmes):

F Cly-Nat
 F Mid (S) F Cly-NAT
 F Bre (S) F Mid
 F Mar-Spa (sc)
 A Hol holds
 A Bel (S) A Hol
 A Ruh-Mun
 A Nun-Boh

RUSSIA (Ripperda):
A Vie-Tyr
A Bud-Tri
 A Rum (S) TURKISH F Bla-Bul (sc)
 A Sev-Ukr
 A Ukr-Gal
A War-Sil
 A Mos-War
 F Ber (S) ENGLISH F Kie

TURKEY (Lariton):

F Bla-Bul (sc)
A Con (S) F Bla-Bul (sc)
 A Smy (S) A Con

Underlined moves do not succeed.

The "Fall 1907" moves are due 13 May 1975.

|||||

"Spring 1907"

TDA #4

R-12

ENGLAND (Cleaveland):

F Nth (S) F Den
F Den (S) RUSSIAN F Nwy-Swe

GERMANY (Ayres):

A Kie-Ruh
 A Hol (S) A Kie-Ruh
 A Mun (S) A Kie-Ruh
 F Bal-Den

TURKEY (Smith): NMR

A Arm
A Ser [Dislodged]
 F Gre
 F Rum [Dislodged]
 F Aeg

FRANCE (Roter):

A Bel (S) A Ruh
A Ruh (S) A Bel
 A Bur (S) A Ruh
 F Tyr-Wes
 F Lon holds
 F Eng (S) A Bel
 F Bre-Mid

ITALY (Sidor):

A Tri-Ser
 A Bud (S) A Tri-Ser
 A Rom-Von
 F Tun-Ion
 F Nap (S) F Tun-Ion
 F Ven-Tri
 F Adr (S) F Ven-Tri

RUSSIA (Stehle):
 A Mos (S) A Sev
 A War-Sil
 A Ukr-Rum
 A Gal (S) A Ukr-Rum
 A Sev (S) A Ukr-Rum
 F Nwy-Swe
 F Liv-Cly

Underlined moves do not succeed.

The retreats of the dislodged units and the "Fall 1907" moves are due 13 May 1975.

|||||

"Spring 1901"

TDA #8

R#16

AUSTRIA (Brooks):

A Vie-Tri
A Bud-Ser
F Tri-Alb

FRANCE (George):

A Par-Gas
A Mar-Spa
F Bre-Mid

ITALY (Doyle):

A Rom-Apu
A Ven-holds
F Nap-Ion

ENGLAND (Holmes):

A Liv-Yor
F Edi-Nrg
F Lon-Nth

GERMANY (Lischett):

A Ber-Kie
A Mun-Ruh
F Kie-Bal

RUSSIA (Treso):

F StP (sc)-Bot
F Sev-Bla
A Mos-StP
A War-Ukr

TURKEY (Crtiz):

A Con-Bul
A Smy-Con
F Ank-Bla

Underlined moves do not succeed. All players note: Houserule 9 and Sample Ruling 3 have been eliminated for this game. If any player needs a copy of the Houserulss, let me know in writing.

"Fall 1901" moves are due 13 May 1975.

#####
Deadline for all games is 13 May 1975. Publication date is 17 May 1975.
#####

To be sure that your moves are received before the deadline, please send them to my Post Office box if they are sent within a week of the doadline --- the mail service tends to be more regular than home delivery during the summer.

The address is: Chris Schleicher, PO Box 907 F, Wheeling, Illinois 60090.